

REPORT SUMMARY

REFERENCE NO - 20/02298/LBC		
APPLICATION PROPOSAL		
Listed Building Consent: Variation of Condition 2 (Approved Plans) of 20/00154/LBC - Internal and external alterations including associated drainage and retention of external stairwell and new kiln room door; amendment to basement layout of AEC building; addition of metal IT cage to Museum building; minor change from door from infill extension to courtyard; demolition of one existing later addition wall to first floor of the AEC; minor changes to archive extension windows; creation of access between the archive extension and museum roof		
ADDRESS Tunbridge Wells Library Adult Education Centre Museum And Art Gallery Mount Pleasant Road Royal Tunbridge Wells Kent		
RECOMMENDATION to GRANT listed building consent subject to conditions (please refer to section 11.0 of the report for full recommendation)		
SUMMARY OF REASONS FOR RECOMMENDATION#		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The proposal would result in the delivery of the Tunbridge Wells Cultural Hub on a site allocated for this purpose within the Site Allocations Local Plan (July 2016). The proposal represents minor changes from the previous approvals granted under reference 17/03642/LBC, 19/00614/LBC and 20/00154/LBC The overall proposal would reduce the previously accepted amount of harm to the two listed buildings within the application site; this harm, which overall remains at the 'less than substantial' level, is considered to be outweighed by the public benefits of the proposal; Other issues raised have been assessed and there are not any which would warrant refusal of the application or which cannot be satisfactorily controlled by condition. 		
REASON FOR REFERRAL TO COMMITTEE		
Tunbridge Wells Borough Council is the applicant and freehold owner of land within the application site		
WARD Park	PARISH/TOWN COUNCIL N/A	APPLICANT Mr Patrick Rynne AGENT Mr Edward Dunderdale
DECISION DUE DATE EOT 02/11/20	PUBLICITY EXPIRY DATE 02/10/20	OFFICER SITE VISIT DATE Various
RELEVANT PLANNING HISTORY (including appeals and relevant history on adjoining sites):		

Whole site

20/02719/SUB	Submission of Details in Relation to Condition 5 (Brickwork Details and Sample) of 20/00154/LBC	Granted	07/10/20
20/00253/FULL	Variation of Condition 2 of 19/00577/FULL - Internal and external alterations to the current permission including: amendments to the internal layout, retention of an existing lift and associated layout changes, plus	Granted	27/03/20

	changes to agreed external materials including the omission of zinc cladding and amendments to the brick specification		
20/00154/LBC	Listed Building Consent: Variation of Condition 2 of 19/00614/LBC - Internal and external alterations to the current consent including: amendments to the internal layout, retention of an existing lift and associated layout changes, plus changes to agreed external materials including the omission of zinc cladding and amendments to the brick specification	Granted	27/03/20
19/00614/LBC	Listed Building Consent - Partial demolition of the Adult Education Centre, Museum and Library and removal of two huts to the rear of the site. Erection of extensions to the side and rear of the Adult Education Centre, Museum and Library to create a unified Cultural Hub. Associated internal and external alterations.	Granted	09/05/19
19/00577/FULL	Variation of Condition 2 (Approved Plans) of 17/03640/FULL - Omission of proposed lantern above the Museum entrance; Removal of screen between existing Museum entrance and lending library; Removal of lightwell to the west elevation of the AEC building; Removal of stairwell to the south elevation of the AEC; Omission of Door DG.39 From AEC ground floor entrance; AEC Corridor Doors at ground, first and second floor level to be replaced instead of retained; New structural arrangement to café; addition of roof plant to AEC; Alterations to infill extension design; Amendments to external acoustic screen to roof plant area above archive extension	Granted	09/05/19
18/03185/SUB	Proposal: Submission of details in relation to Conditions 3 (sustainable surface water drainage scheme), 5 (disposal of sewage), 7 (noise levels), 10 (hard and soft landscaping scheme), 12 (biodiversity enhancement), 16 (fencing/gates to the rear of the site) and 18 (renewable energy technologies) of 17/03640/FULL	Pending consideration	
18/03914/SUB	Proposal: Submission of Details in Relation	Granted	17/01/19

	to Condition 6 Part 1 (Preliminary Risk Assessment), Part 2 (Site Investigation), Part 3 (Remediation Method Statement) of 17/03640/FULL.		
17/03640/FULL	Proposal: Partial demolition of the Adult Education Centre, Museum and Library and removal of two huts to the rear of the site. Erection of extensions to the side and rear of the Adult Education Centre, Museum and Library to create a unified Cultural Hub	Granted	24/01/18
17/03642/LBC	Proposal: Listed Building Consent - Partial demolition of the Adult Education Centre, Museum and Library and removal of two huts to the rear of the site. Erection of extensions to the side and rear of the Adult Education Centre, Museum and Library to create a unified Cultural Hub. Associated internal and external alterations.	Granted	24/01/18

Tunbridge Wells Library, Museum and Art Gallery

15/504150/COUNTY	County Council Regulation 3 application for a single storey extension to the fire escape lobby area and new tarmac path leading to the existing car park.	No Objections	18/06/15
13/00990/LBC	Listed Building Consent: Divide an existing office into two and form new door opening in existing wall with general refurbishment of area to form Register Office space	Granted	21/06/13
12/00814/KCCRG3	Regulation 3 (KCC) Extension to rear of building to house new lift	No Objections	02/05/12
12/00500/LBC	Listed Building Consent: External lift shaft and internal alterations including new lift lobbies, w/cs and doors	Granted	18/07/12
07/00723/LBC	Listed Building Consent - Repairs/upgrading to main roof	Granted	26/04/07
07/00528/LBC	Listed Building Consent - Replace existing opening hours sign with new design of same size	Granted	05/04/07
05/02190/LBC	Listed Building Consent - Temporary consent for raising the path and fitting guard rail.	Granted	17/10/05
04/02025/KCCRG3	Disabled access improvements - Alterations to height of pavement outside Library	No Objections	12/09/05

04/01838/LBC	Listed Building Consent - To provide disabled access into and around the ground floor	Granted	12/09/05
00/02283/LBC	Listed Building Consent - New external and internal banners and external notice board	Granted	12/03/01
00/02296/ADV	Advertisement - non illuminated projecting banners	Granted	19/12/00
00/00987/LBC	Listed Building Consent - New display cases and reception counter in foyer and museum	Granted	26/07/00
98/01503/LBC	Listed Building Consent - repairs to 4 no. brick corners to parapet with insertion of expansion joints to parapet wall	Called in by Secretary of State	07/12/98

Adult Education Centre

12/00525/LBC	Listed building consent: 4 no. internal lift lobbies, installation of lift and upgrade of existing doors to provide 30min fire compartmentation to comply with current building regulations	Granted	07/08/12
10/03489/LBC	Listed Building Consent - (1) Repairs to front elevation stonework and roof; (2) Secondary glazing fire protection to 3 No. large windows adjacent to fire escape; (3) Removal and infill of 3 No. pavement lights	Granted	10/01/11
03/00076/LBC	Listed Building Consent - Ramp to front entrance	Granted	16/07/03
02/02948/KCCRG3	KCC Joint Regulation 3 - Disabled ramp to front elevation and installation of front entrance doors	No Objections	03/01/03

MAIN REPORT

1.0 DESCRIPTION OF SITE

- 1.01 This application refers to part of the wider civic complex within Tunbridge Wells Town Centre. The application site is approximately 0.24ha in size and comprises the Adult Education Centre (AEC) and the library and museum building. Both of these are Grade II Listed, and the application site is situated within the Tunbridge Wells and Rusthall Conservation Area. The whole site is currently closed as the Amelia Scott project is under construction pursuant to the earlier planning permissions/LBCs granted in 2018, 2019 and 2020.
- 1.02 The existing buildings on site comprise the three-storey AEC building and the two-storey library & museum building. Both the main buildings have basement areas. Two huts for use by the AEC formerly stood at the rear of the site but have been

demolished as part of the implementation of the 2018 - 2020 planning permissions and listed building consents.

- 1.03 The library and museum were built in 1939, fitted out during WWII and finally completed in the early 1950s. External materials are largely brown brick with reconstituted stone dressings. Distinctive features of the building identified in the listing description are the stone coping and band at the top with the wording "LIBRARY AND MUSEUM"; the eight 30-pane sashes and central tall window incorporating a double door with lotus decoration and a frieze above; and the large well staircase. In the late 1960s, the bowed ground floor section at the rear was extended upwards to form a rear first floor reference library. This section has also been removed as part of the Amelia project.
- 1.04 The AEC (originally called the Technical Institute) is a red brick building on a stone plinth dating from 1902 and reflects the Art Nouveau style. Notable features include three immense stone dormer windows on the 2nd floor, the use of casement windows and three large bays on the first floor; and the frieze above the first floor.
- 1.05 Prior to redevelopment the AEC building and the two huts provided a range of classes along with offices, storage, WCs and a café. There were formerly parking bays on the southern side of the site and between the two huts.
- 1.06 The museum, library and registration services were housed in the existing library building (with services currently being temporarily being delivered from a Unit within the Royal Victoria Place). The ground floor hosted the main lending library along with WCs and offices/workroom. The reference library/local studies section, museum and art gallery were on the first floor, again with ancillary offices/storage. The building's basement included a staff room, storage areas, reserve book stock and archive material storage, along with a small kitchen.
- 1.07 To the south of the site is the Grade II listed Town Hall, Assembly Hall Theatre, police station and former Magistrates' Court. To the east is Monson House, a 1980s office block. To the west is Civic Way, a grassed/tree lined area dividing Civic Way from Mount Pleasant Road and the Grade II listed war memorial. North of the site is Monson Colonnade, Nos. 36-50 (evens) Monson Road and the Opera House, which are all Grade II listed

2.0 PROPOSAL

- 2.01 Application 17/03642/LBC granted listed building consent for works to facilitate a new Cultural Hub (TWCH) offering access to a range of public and other services for the area. The project has since been named 'The Amelia Scott', after Amelia Scott (1860 - 1952) who was a British social reformer, campaigner for women's suffrage and one of the first two women elected as Tunbridge Wells councillors. However the supporting development plan policy documents still refer to the project as the 'Cultural Hub', however, this makes no difference to the planning considerations of the proposal.
- 2.02 The current proposal is to undertake amendments to the scheme, which are detailed further on within this section.
- 2.03 The proposal remains to refurbish and renovate the existing museum and library building in Civic Way and the AEC on Monson Road, by incorporating extensions to bring the two buildings together and demolishing the two huts at the rear, which were

argued to present accessibility issues and to be unfit for purpose. The following services are proposed to be incorporated in the new extended complex of buildings:

- Museum
- Library and Archive
- Adult Learning Education Centre
- Tourist Information Centre
- Gateway Services
- Birth/death Registration Services

2.04 The development would also include a café, shop and other public facilities.

Specific works

2.05 The proposal remains as an extension and reconfiguration works to the existing AEC and Museum and Library buildings. The overall proposals remain to:

- Demolish the two AEC 'huts' to the rear of the site;
- Removal of the first floor level at the rear of the library & museum building, plus removal of the entire east-facing rear wall and both first and second floor levels to create better links with the AEC;
- Removal of the ground floor WC structure to the rear of the AEC;
- Creation of a barrel-roofed infill extension linking the AEC with the library & museum. This would be designed as a lightweight timber/steel structure with a fully glazed façade to Monson Road and continuation of the existing AEC stone plinth at ground level, with a further glazed area overlooking the new courtyard;
- Creation of two storey extension to the rear of the library & museum to house a temporary exhibition space, workshop and ancillary storage plus a loading bay accessed via a roller shutter (ground floor). There would be a reference library/archive (first floor) - this extension would be purpose built for these uses. The design is intended to reflect a brick-built 'box' with a stone plinth that relates to the banding around the top of the museum/library;
- A new external courtyard space to provide an area for temporary exhibitions/events, plus a café seating area with gates (to be designed by a commissioned artist) to the east boundary to secure the area;
- A new steel-framed lantern-style roof light over the top of the main library & museum entrance to provide additional light to the staircase area;
- Replacement/restoration of the existing rooflights to the museum galleries;
- New automatic sliding doors to the AEC, with retention of the existing doors (enabling them to be held open);
- Opening up of the rear elevation of the AEC and its cafe with new windows/doors to provide access to the courtyard;
- Insulation and recovering of the flat roof of the library & museum building, zinc covered and louvered plant areas on the southern side (on the roof of the existing building and the proposed extension) adjacent to a solar PV array;
- Insulation and secondary glazing throughout the buildings;
- Various alterations to the fenestration on both buildings.

2.06 Both buildings would maintain their respective entrances on to Civic Way and Monson Road.

2.07 The rationale behind the layout is to provide a 'noisy' wing on the north side and a 'quiet' wing to the south.

2.08 The new uses and features within each floor of the TWCH would be;

Basement

- Enhanced museum and library stores to include 'roller racking' and quarantine rooms;
- New lifts within the existing southern wing of the library and within the AEC to serve all floors;
- A new 'Education Suite' within the basement of the AEC, with the formation of lightwells in the adjacent pavement to provide natural light to these areas and ancillary kitchen/WC;
- A new, separate commercial kitchen within the AEC to serve the existing first floor café.

Ground Floor

- Following demolition of the rear wall of the library and part of the side wall of the library & museum (facing Monson Road), the creation of a large open plan entrance/museum/library space;
- The creation of a new large glazed screen within the north elevation of the infill extension;
- Refurbishment of the entrance hall of the museum and library, the removal of the wall between the entrance and the open plan introduction space and installation of a new glazed screen;
- What is currently the Adult Fiction section will become the children's library; the existing children's library will become the new Tourist Information Centre, shop and a permanent 'Story of Tunbridge Wells' exhibition;
- On the southern side, a new entrance/reception area for Gateway services using the existing library & museum staff entrance;
- Re-modelling of the internal staircase serving that existing staff entrance;
- Internal alterations around the current library workroom to provide extra library and museum space and improve circulation around the extended building;
- A new stair core within the new two-storey extension and a loading bay for the whole building;
- Conversion of the ground floor of the AEC in to pottery and print studios;
- AEC entrance: new automatic doors and refurbishment of the staircase to its original design;
- Retention of the existing café space in the AEC, through moving it from the front to the rear of the building;
- Gallery and Registration spaces on the northern side of the AEC – the latter with its own entrance, separate from the rest of the hub.

First Floor

- The new infill structure will accommodate the main library reading room in the centre of the extended building, with a reading room and artists' resource space at the northern end, plus new WCs;
- Refurbishment of the existing galleries in the western range of the building, including restoration of the original ceilings, the new/refurbished roof lights and removal of modern suspended ceilings;
- Extensive internal alterations at the southern end (currently the museum and its storage area) to create a new gallery;
- In the extended part, a new reference library, local studies and archives space and a second births/deaths registration area;
- Use of the first floor of the AEC to provide staff offices, a specialist silversmithing area and studio/classroom space.

Second Floor (AEC building only)

- Refurbishment of the existing galleries, including restoration of the western art studio to its original plan;
- Use of rest of the floor as office/education space and for the TWBC call centre.

2.09 The outdoor courtyard area would comprise two distinct terraces. One would be adjacent to the café and the other would be a temporary events space. The specific details of this are not finalised, but would comprise a mixture of tree planting plus soft and hard landscaping.

Amendments permitted under 19/00614/LBC

2.10 A revised LBC application was approved in May 2019 for the following changes;

- Removal of screen between the lobby and the east landing library;
- Omission of proposed lantern above the Museum entrance;
- Removal of existing lightwell to the west elevation of the AEC building;
- Removal of existing stairwell to the south elevation of the AEC;
- Omission of Door DG.39 From AEC ground floor entrance;
- AEC Corridor Doors at ground, first and second floor level to be replaced instead of retained;
- New structural arrangement to café to the ground floor of the AEC;
- Addition of roof plant to AEC;
- Amendments to external acoustic screen to roof plant area above archive extension;
- Alterations to infill extension design;
- Curtain walling omitted to south end of barrel vault elevation.

Amendments permitted under 20/00154/LBC

2.11 A revised LBC application was approved in May 2019 for the following changes;

- Retention of the existing AEC lift and associated changes to the AEC west elevation and roof to remove the overrun;
- Retention of four of the original AEC windows on its current western elevation to become internal windows following construction of the infill extension;
- Change in brick produce from Peterson bricks to Tonbridge Handmade Pastone and Grey Brown blend;
- Change in roofing material for barrel-vault infill extension from zinc (Rhein zinc) to Sarnafil with an aluminium fascia panel replacing zinc at eaves level and around the edge of the windows facing Monson Road.
- Minor changes to the appearance of the courtyard-elevation windows within the two storey rear extension;

Changes proposed under this application

2.12 The following changes involving both internal and external alterations are sought. Paragraphs marked with an asterisk (*) refer to works that do not require listed building consent because they involve interventions to a listed building, but rather because they involve amendments to the previously approved listed building consents;

a. Amendment to basement layout of AEC building;

The existing rear stairwell leading from the basement would be retained rather than being demolished, with a concrete cap placed at the top so the surface finish from the adjacent yard is continuous. The existing stairwell would instead be left as an underground vented space.

A 'sump and pump' originally intended to serve the new basement toilets would not be built and instead the drainage would be gravity fed, avoiding the need for deep excavation. The below-slab drainage runs will be installed below the existing drainage slab.*

- b. Addition of metal IT cage to Museum building basement room;
This would be fitted within a basement room and is described as being little more than a substantial piece of fitted furniture, therefore being unlikely to require LBC in itself. It would accommodate IT equipment originally proposed to be within adjacent room thus reducing cabling runs through the walls.*
- c. Minor change to door from infill extension to courtyard;
An additional mullion has been included to reduce the width of a mullion door to allow for a sliding door mechanism. This is an amendment to a new part of the building and has no impact on historic fabric.*
- d. Demolition of one existing later addition wall to first floor of the AEC;
This involves the removal of a low significance 1960s panel wall which is considered to be beyond repair, is unlikely to meet modern fire rating standards and cannot take the weight of additional fixings. The wall will be replaced in a slightly different position to provide better access to one of the adjoining rooms and more space to another.
- e. Minor changes to archive extension windows;
This involved a slight reduction in their width.*
- f. Creation of access between the archive extension and museum roof;
This would involve removing a small section of the parapet (judged to be of 'medium' significance in previous heritage statements) to allow for a means of access and escape between the existing roof and the new extension's roof.
- g. Replacement kiln room door;
This item was added to the application after validation. The already consented design has changed the use of a store to the ground floor of the AEC to a kiln room for the pottery classes which will move from the now demolished huts to the ground floor of the AEC. Given the nature of the activities within the Kiln Room, the proposed Fire Strategy has identified the Kiln Room as requiring a 1 hour fire rated enclosure – which included the door to the Kiln Room being upgraded to a FD(S)60 rating. However this has now been found to be impossible and the door will be replaced. The new door will have the same details and profiles of the existing building.

3.0 SUMMARY INFORMATION

	Existing	Proposed	Change (+/-)
Site Area	0.2 ha	0.2 ha	No change
Gross External Area	3873 sq.m	4544 sq.m	+671 sq.m
Internal Floorspace	3390 sq.m	3972 sq.m: Additional 1182 sq.m, with 600 sq.m	+582 sq.m

		to be removed.	
Land use	Adult Education Centre, Museum, library, gallery space and ancillary outdoor, office and storage areas	Adult Education Centre, Museum, library, gallery space and ancillary outdoor, office and storage areas along with Tourist Information Centre and Gateway	Addition of Tourist Information Office and Gateway
Car parking spaces (inc. disabled)	8 along southern edge plus space for 4-5 in the courtyard	0, with a dedicated loading bay included on the eastern elevation.	-12/13
Cycle spaces	0	24	+24
No. of storeys	AEC: 3 Library & museum: 2	AEC: 3 Library & museum: 2	No change
Max ridge height	AEC: 18.9m Library: 10.4m	No change to existing building heights. Infill extension: 14.9m. Rear extension: 9.9m Height of top of lantern from ground level: 12.1m	As set out in preceding column
Max height inc. plant	As above	As above except for 11.8m for Rear Extension	As set out in preceding column
No. of jobs	25 Full-time (FT), 23 Part-time (PT)	30 FT, 25 PT	+5 FT and +2 PT

4.0 PLANNING CONSTRAINTS

The Tunbridge Wells Library, Museum & Art Gallery and Adult Education Centre buildings are both Grade II listed (*statutory duty to preserve or enhance the significance of heritage assets under the Planning (Listed Buildings & Conservation Areas) Act 1990*)

5.0 POLICY AND OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

The National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) 2019
National Planning Practice Guidance (NPPG)

Site Allocations Local Plan Adopted 2016

Policy AL/STR 1: Limits to Built Development

Policy AL/RTW 2A: Civic Complex/Crescent Road Area of Change

Tunbridge Wells Borough Core Strategy 2010

Core Policy 4: Environment

Core Policy 9: Development in Tunbridge Wells

Tunbridge Wells Borough Local Plan 2006

Policy EN1: Development Control Criteria

Supplementary Planning Documents

Civic Development Planning Framework

Other documents:

Tunbridge Wells Cultural Strategy 2014-24

6.0 LOCAL REPRESENTATIONS

6.01 Site notices were displayed around the application site on 11 September 2020. The application was also advertised in the local press.

6.02 No comments have been received from members of the public.

7.0 CONSULTATIONS

7.01 Historic England

(24/09/20) – No comment. *(Officers' Note: on 18/12/17 Historic England provided detailed comments on the original application. They supported it on heritage grounds).*

7.02 TWBC Principal Conservation Officer

(15/10/20 – verbal) – no objections to kiln door replacement

7.03 **(09/10/20)** - have reviewed the application drawings and supporting documents and am familiar with the site and previous applications.

7.04 The works to the AEC basement have been [considered] in detail prior to submission of these proposals. The changes being suggested will lead to the retention of original and historic fabric previously proposed for loss and will as a result mean the alterations proposed will be less harmful than those permitted. On this basis, raise no objection to the proposed works. Sufficient details have been submitted and would not suggest any additional conditions.

7.05 The remaining items of work have not previously been discussed in detail. Those works are:

- Addition of metal IT cage to Museum building;
- Minor change from door from infill extension to courtyard;
- Demolition of one existing later addition wall to first floor of the AEC;
- Minor changes to archive extension windows;
- Creation of access between the archive extension and museum roof.

These works are minor and will not impact the heritage assets in a manner that will harm significance.

7.06 On this basis, PCO raises no objection to the proposed works

8.0 APPLICANT'S SUPPORTING COMMENTS (summary of covering letter)

- 8.01 The majority of the changes are minor in nature and have been undertaken so as to, where possible, create heritage gains. Other changes are negligible and overall result in no impact on the buildings.

9.0 BACKGROUND PAPERS AND PLANS

- 9.01 Application form
Heritage Statement October 2018
Cover letter
Fire resistance report
Stage 4 Fire Strategy

10.0 APPRAISAL

- 10.01 The issue to be considered is whether the proposal is acceptable in terms of its impact on the listed buildings (AEC and the library & museum) and their settings. This is the same approach that was applied to the previous LBC applications.
- 10.02 There is a statutory duty for local planning authorities in considering whether to grant listed building consent, to have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.
- 10.03 Para 185 of the NPPF sets out that;

'Plans should set out a positive strategy for the conservation and enjoyment of the historic environment, including heritage assets most at risk through neglect, decay or other threats. This strategy should take into account:

- a) the desirability of sustaining and enhancing the significance of heritage assets, and putting them to viable uses consistent with their conservation;*
- b) the wider social, cultural, economic and environmental benefits that conservation of the historic environment can bring;*
- c) the desirability of new development making a positive contribution to local character and distinctiveness; and*
- d) opportunities to draw on the contribution made by the historic environment to the character of a place.*

Footnote 62 clarifies that the principles set out in section 12 of the NPPF apply to the heritage-related consent regimes as well as plan making and decision making.

- 10.04 Para 194 makes it clear that the significance of a heritage asset can be harmed or lost through its alteration or destruction or development within its setting. As heritage assets are irreplaceable, any harm or loss should require clear and convincing justification. Substantial harm to or loss of a grade II listed building should be exceptional. Para 195 states that substantial harm to or total loss of significance of a designated heritage asset should be refused consent, unless it can be demonstrated that the substantial harm or loss is necessary to achieve substantial public benefits that outweigh that harm or loss, or all of the following apply:

'a) the nature of the heritage asset prevents all reasonable uses of the site; and

- b) no viable use of the heritage asset itself can be found in the medium term through appropriate marketing that will enable its conservation; and*
- c) conservation by grant-funding or some form of not for profit, charitable or public ownership is demonstrably not possible; and*
- d) the harm or loss is outweighed by the benefit of bringing the site back into use.'*

10.05 Para 196 states that;

'Where a development proposal will lead to less than substantial harm to the significance of a designated heritage asset, this harm should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal including, where appropriate, securing its optimum viable use.'

Extant consents

10.06 The original proposal involves internal and external alteration to both buildings, as set out in section 2.0. This is particularly relevant to the library & museum, where the entire rear wall and half of the external wall facing Monson Road will be completely removed, as will a large amount of internal walling.

10.07 The Heritage Statement submitted as part of the previous LBC evaluates the significance of particular areas of the building, based on;

- The original or historic plan-form and significance of building fabric and;
- The contribution of the elevations to townscape/aesthetic value and their architectural emphasis.

10.08 The most significant and important areas of the buildings (the front elevations) will remain largely unchanged by the originally-approved project. Being 20th Century buildings, much of the internal fabric (except the original glass screens in the library) is not considered to be of significant intrinsic value, however the location and plan form of internal walls relates to the original layout and design of these municipal buildings and reflects the purposes for which they were originally intended.

10.09 The PCO summarised on the previous iterations of this scheme that the harm caused to the two listed buildings by the individual changes ranges from 'less than substantial' to 'substantial' in the case of the demolition of the rear wall of the library building. This is because the greater the cumulative number of individual changes, the greater the level of harm. There are benefits from the development too, namely the removal of many of the inappropriate later interventions including modern suspended ceilings, steel fire escapes and internal subdivisions which are significant heritage benefits.

Current amendments

10.10 The comments of the Council's Principal Conservation Officer (PCO) were given significant weight in the determination of the previous applications, as they will be here. In general, the PCO agreed with the previous Heritage Statement's assessment of impact and harm of the individual changes to the listed buildings. The PCO considered in previous applications that any residual areas of concern they highlighted could be resolved by condition.

10.11 Their comments on this current application are that the revised scheme results in a lesser degree of harm to the heritage assets than was previously found acceptable. Historic England raises no objections either. It can therefore be reasonably concluded that the public benefits of the scheme, which remain unchanged, would

similarly outweigh the reduced level of harm and be consistent with previous decisions.

Overall summary

- 10.12 In cases where 'less than substantial' harm is found, NPPF paragraph 196 thus applies. This is not to ignore the statutory duty imposed in LPAs by section 66(1) and 72(i) of the Act. If the LPA considers that the harm is less than substantial, the harm must still be given considerable importance and weight. It is a judgement for the decision-maker as to whether the non-heritage public benefits of the proposal and securing the optimum viable use of the assets outweigh that identified 'less than substantial' harm; and whether the proposal secures the optimum viable use of the buildings.
- 10.13 However with regards to this development the harm has already been assessed through earlier applications and found to be outweighed by the public benefits of the proposal. Therefore, given that this variation of the previous consent would result in less harm than has previously been permitted, it is not considered necessary to undertake this balancing exercise again.
- 10.14 In summary, whilst the resulting harm to the heritage assets is still considered overall to be towards the upper end of less than substantial, this harm is still considered to be outweighed by the previously-appraised public benefits of the scheme and securing the assets' optimum viable use. On this basis the tests within NPPF para 196 is still considered to be met and it is recommended that Listed Building Consent is granted.
- 10.15 Conditions from the previous consent can be repeated. In some cases the necessary details have also been approved pursuant to conditions submissions and can be re-worded accordingly.

11.0 RECOMMENDATION – GRANT Subject to the following conditions;

- (1) The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans:

220E Proposed Basement Plan;
221I Proposed Ground Floor Plan;
222F Proposed First Floor Plan;
223F Proposed Second Floor Plan;
230E Proposed Roof Plan;
240E Proposed Elevations;
241D Proposed Elevations;
242E Proposed Elevations;
250E Proposed Sections;
251E Proposed Sections;
252E Proposed Sections;
253B Barrel Vault Sections;
260A AEC windows
262A Proposed Elevational Section
2100C (in respect of Barrel Vault roofing and exterior glazed screens materials only)
2101C (in respect of Barrel Vault roofing materials only)
2102C (in respect of Barrel Vault roofing materials only)
2103C (in respect of Barrel Vault roofing and exterior glazed screens materials only)
2104C (in respect of Barrel Vault roofing and exterior glazed screens materials only)
3500C (in respect of Barrel Vault roofing materials only)

Specification sheet for curtain walling
Sample photograph of curtain walling
Sample photograph of curtain walling RAL colour
3101C - Barrel Vault - Section 3 Risers
3780E and 3785D
Details of Aluminium Coping System
Details of Sarnafil G476 SA Waterproofing Membrane
Details of Sarnafil G476-SA Polymeric membrane for roof waterproofing
Details of Sarnafil Decor Profile PVC

Details approved under 19/00614/LBC:

Barrel vault details: 3100 Rev B, 3102 Rev B, 3105 Rev B, 3110 Rev B, 3111 Rev B, 3120 Rev B;

WOW wall details: 3130 Rev G, 3131 Rev B, 3132 Rev B, 3133 Rev B;

Sections: 3200 Rev B, 3201 Rev B, 3202 Rev B, 3210 Rev C;

Gallery details: 3230 Rev B, 3240 Rev B, 3241 Rev B, 3250 Rev C, 3251 Rev C;

Museum details: 3300 Rev B, 3301 Rev A, 3320 Rev B, 3321 Rev B, 3330 Rev B, 3340 Rev C, 3360 Rev B, 3361 Rev B, 3365;

Basement-AEC WC Construction Plans: 3420 Rev D;

Roofing details: 3500 Rev B, 3510 Rev B;

AEC details: 3720 Rev B, 3721 Rev C, 3725, 3730 Rev C, 3740 Rev C, 3741 Rev C, 3750 Rev A, 3770 Rev B, 3771 Rev B, 3781 Rev C, 3782 Rev C, 3783 Rev C, 3784 Rev C, 3786 Rev B, 3787 Rev B, 3788 Rev D, 3789 Rev B, 3790 Rev B, 3791 Rev B, 3792 Rev B, 3793 Rev B, 3794 Rev B;

Window and door details: 4001 Rev H, 4002 Rev D, 4003 Rev C, 4004 Rev C, 4005 Rev B, 4006 Rev B, 4007 Rev B, 4008 Rev B; 4011 Rev E;

Door details: 4100 Rev E, 4101 Rev C, 4102 Rev B, 4103 Rev B, 4110 Rev F, 4111 Rev F, 4112 Rev F, 4113 Rev C, 4114 Rev C, 4115 Rev C, 4116 Rev D, 4117 Rev D, 4118 Rev D, 4119 Rev B, 4120 Rev B, 4121 Rev B, 4122 Rev B, 4123 Rev B, 4124 Rev B, 4125 Rev B, 4126 Rev B;

Other details: 4140 Rev B, 4145 Rev B, 4150 Rev B, 4155 Rev B;

Internal screens/divisions and curtain walling: 4310 Rev C, 4311 Rev C, 4710 Rev B, 4711 Rev B, 4712 Rev B;

Demolition plans: 5100 Rev C, 5101 Rev C, 5102 Rev C, 5103 Rev C, 5104 Rev C, 5110 Rev C, 5111 Rev C, 5112 Rev C, 5120 Rev C, 5121 Rev C, 5122 Rev C, 5123 Rev C;

Repair plans: 5200 Rev C, 5201 Rev C, 5202 Rev C, 5203 Rev C, 5204 Rev C, 5210 Rev D, 5211 Rev C, 5212 Rev C, 5213 Rev C, 5214 Rev B, 5215 Rev B, 5216 Rev B, 5217 Rev B.

Details approved under 19/03416/SUB: Letter of intent and attached draft bill and draft construction programme; Finalised legal agreement dated 09/12/19

Reason: To clarify which plans are approved.

- (3) Notwithstanding the submitted drawings and all supporting documentation, the existing historic double doors, frames and architraves at ground floor and first floor level, along with those located on the entrance lobby (and all associated ironmongery) shall be retained in situ and maintained as such in perpetuity.

Reason: To preserve the character and historic fabric of the buildings

- (4) All new leadwork shall be completed in conformity with the recommendations set down by the Lead Sheet Association in their most recent publication. In complying with the Lead Sheet Association recommendations, all alterations to existing lead profiles or detailing required shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to the commencement of such works. The works shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: To preserve the special character of the listed buildings

- (5) The development shall be constructed in accordance with the brick panel approved under reference 20/02719/SUB.

Reason: To preserve the special character of the listed buildings.

- (6) Notwithstanding the submitted drawings and all supporting documentation, no development shall commence on the exterior glazed screens until details of the associated mullion depths have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The works shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: To preserve the special character of the listed buildings

- (7) The works hereby approved shall be carried out strictly in accordance with the approved details regarding a contract for the carrying out of the approved works of the full redevelopment of the site (reference: 19/03416/SUB)

Reason: To preserve the historic fabric of the listed and curtilage listed buildings

INFORMATIVES

N/A

Case Officer: Richard Hazelgrove

- NB For full details of all papers submitted with this application please refer to the relevant Public Access pages on the council's website.

The conditions set out in the report may be subject to such reasonable change as is necessary to ensure accuracy and enforceability.